

DATE: August 6, 2019

TO: Todd Wyett, Chairman
State Transportation Commission

FROM: Paul C. Ajegba, P.E.
Director

SUBJECT: Waiver of Commission Approval

The projects and descriptions documented in Exhibit A-1 attached, will be let by the Michigan Department of Transportation on August 9, 2019. These projects require pre-approval as the engineers' estimates are over \$500,000. The approximate 10-week delay resulting if Commission pre-approval were deferred to the next State Transportation Commission meeting on October 17, 2019, would delay the transmittal of the contract documents to the low bidders, and jeopardize the construction schedules.

The projects and descriptions documented in Exhibit A-2, attached, were let by the Michigan Department of Transportation on June 28, and July 12, 2019. The projects on this exhibit either received low bids more than 10% over the engineers' estimate, or received one bid, but had an engineer's estimate over \$500,000 and therefore require approval by the State Transportation Commission. The approximate 10-week delay resulting if Commission approval were deferred to the next State Transportation Commission meeting on October 17, 2019, would delay the transmittal of the contract documents to the low bidder, and jeopardize the construction schedule.

The projects and descriptions documented in Exhibit A-3, attached, were let on June 28, 2019. The projects are being submitted for informational purposes since only one bid was received for each project and the engineers' estimates were less than \$500,000.

A waiver of the required Commission approval is requested, as provided in Commission Resolution 79-3, as amended, footnote F:

"If, in the opinion of the Director, the public interest requires that a certain contract be awarded or an agreement be executed prior to approval by the Commission, hereunder, the Director shall seek a waiver of the required approval from the Chairman of the Transportation Commission. If the request of the approval is verbal, the waiver shall be confirmed, in writing, within fourteen (14) days."

Waiver of Commission Approval
August 6, 2019

If the waiver is granted, the Department will proceed to execute the items noted above.

Signed copy on file

Director

The request for waiver of Commission approval of the above-mentioned item is approved.

Signed copy on file

Todd Wyett, Chairman

August 2, 2019

Date

REQUEST FOR MICHIGAN STATE TRANSPORTATION

COMMISSION APPROVAL

BID LETTING PRE-APPROVAL

August 6, 2019

The following contracts are being submitted for approval.

STATE PROJECT

- | | | |
|----|--|--|
| 1. | Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 012
Project: M 63053-208018
Local Agreement:
Start Date: September 3, 2019
Completion Date: October 28, 2019 | Prequalification Level:
\$766,000.00 |
|----|--|--|

168.68 lane mi of hot mix asphalt crack treatment and overband crack fill of carpool parking lot on US-24 (Telegraph Road) from Vreeland Road to south of West Road, on M-5 (Grand River Avenue) from I-94 to Cass Avenue, on M-102 (8 Mile Road) from M-39 to M-1, on M-53 (Van Dyke Avenue) from Helen Street to Irving Street, on Old 96 (Grand River Avenue) from Sinacola Court to M-5 Freeway, on M-59 (Huron Street) from M-1SB Loop to M-1NB Loop and on US-24 (Dixie Highway)/US-24BR (Cesar Chavez) from I-75 to railroad structures in the cities of Center Line, Detroit, Farmington, Farmington Hills, Ferndale, Flat Rock, Oak Park, Pontiac, Southfield and Sterling Heights, Macomb, Oakland and Wayne Counties. This project includes a 2-year pavement performance warranty.

0.00 % DBE participation required

- | | | |
|----|---|--|
| 2. | Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 024
Project: M 80012-206308
Local Agreement:
Start Date: September 5, 2019
Completion Date: June 19, 2020 | Prequalification Level:
\$771,000.00 |
|----|---|--|

Bridge rehabilitation including epoxy overlay, concrete pavement, railing replacement, substructure patching, guardrail and approach work on I-196 over Van Buren Trail, Van Buren County. This project includes a 5-year epoxy performance warranty.

0.00 % DBE participation required

3. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 025
Project: TA 82000-202796
Local Agreement: 19-5139, 19-5315
Start Date: September 9, 2019
Completion Date: June 1, 2022
- Prequalification Level:
\$754,000.00

0.05 mi of Detroit Riverfront enhancements which include concrete sidewalk and ramp, seawall cap, lighting, fence, site furnishings and landscaping on the Detroit West Riverfront at Cummings Parcel, west of Joe Louis Arena in the city of Detroit, Wayne County.

5.00 % DBE participation required

4. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 026
Project: HSIP 70023-123859-2
Local Agreement:
Start Date: September 9, 2019
Completion Date: June 3, 2020
- Prequalification Level:
\$653,000.00

0.37 mi of hot mix asphalt reconstruction, concrete pavement, curb, gutter, sidewalk and ramps, drainage, signals and pavement markings on I-196BL at 112th Avenue, Ottawa County.

4.00 % DBE participation required

5. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 028
Project: NH 05011-207851
Local Agreement:
Start Date: September 9, 2019
Completion Date: October 25, 2019
- Prequalification Level:
\$1,669,000.00

5.20 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling, resurfacing, pavement repairs, corrugations, delineators, and pavement markings on US-31 from north of Campbell Road to north of Barnes Road, Antrim County. This project includes a 3-year materials and workmanship pavement warranty.

3.00 % DBE participation required

6. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 029
Project: STG 71073-110091
Local Agreement:
Start Date: April 27, 2020
Completion Date: September 25, 2020
- Prequalification Level:
\$1,037,000.00

Non-freeway signing upgrade along US-23, Iosco, Alcona, Alpena and Presque Isle Counties.

0.00 % DBE participation required

7. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 045
Project: M 11051-208316
Local Agreement:
Start Date: September 9, 2019
Completion Date: September 27, 2019
- Prequalification Level:
\$690,000.00
- 1.19 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing and pavement markings on M-51 from Chestnut Lane northerly to North Street, Berrien County.
- 0.00 % DBE participation required
8. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 046
Project: M 72013-207513
Local Agreement:
Start Date: September 3, 2019
Completion Date: November 1, 2019
- Prequalification Level:
\$502,000.00
- 21.22 mi of culvert lining and end section replacement on US-127 northbound from the Roscommon/Clare county line to M-55 and from the Muskegon River to I-75, Crawford and Roscommon Counties.
- 0.00 % DBE participation required
9. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 051
Project: NH 61072-200663-2
Local Agreement:
Start Date: September 4, 2019
Completion Date: September 28, 2020
- Prequalification Level:
\$1,720,000.00
- 7.12 mi of concrete pavement repairs along with ramp, shoulder, hot mix asphalt cold milling and single course overlay on US-31 from Hile Road north to Marquette Avenue in the cities of Muskegon and Norton Shores, Muskegon County. This project includes a 3-year materials and workmanship pavement warranty.
- 3.00 % DBE participation required

LOCAL PROJECTS

10. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 013
Project: STL 11000-206937
Local Agreement: 19-5337
Start Date: 10 days after award
Completion Date: October 18, 2019
- Prequalification Level:
\$637,000.00

3.45 mi of hot mix asphalt single course overlay on East Napier Avenue from Morgan Road to the Baninbridge/Benton township line, Berrien County. This is a Local Agency project.

0.00 % DBE participation required

11. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 020
Project: CMG 63000-202987
Local Agreement: 19-5383
Start Date: 10 days after award
Completion Date: August 14, 2020
- Prequalification Level:
\$2,124,000.00

Traffic signals at 10 locations including mast arms, box spans, signal backplates, and countdown pedestrian signals along 12 Mile Road from Woodward Avenue (M-1) to Connecticut Avenue in the city of Royal Oak, Oakland County. This is a Local Agency project.

0.00 % DBE participation required

12. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 021
Project: STU 41000-130834
Local Agreement: 19-5358
Start Date: 10 days after award
Completion Date: June 15, 2020
- Prequalification Level:
\$1,291,000.00

1.35 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing, concrete, curb and ramps and pavement markings on Market Avenue SW from the I-196 westbound ramp to west of Plaster Creek and from Coit Avenue to Wealthy Street in the city of Grand Rapids, Kent County. This is a Local Agency project.

4.00 % DBE participation required

13. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 023
Project: BO 52000-133091
Local Agreement: 19-5359
Start Date: 10 days after award
Completion Date: September 30, 2020
- Prequalification Level:
\$955,000.00

Bridge replacement with precast three-sided culvert and approach work on County Road FX over middle branch of the Escanaba River, Marquette County. This is a Local Agency project.

0.00 % DBE participation required

14. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 030
Project: EDCF 50000-205898
Local Agreement: 19-5369
Start Date: 10 days after award
Completion Date: August 28, 2020
- Prequalification Level:
\$4,947,000.00

1.00 mi of concrete pavement reconstruction, concrete driveway, curb, gutter, sidewalk and ramps, aggregate base, drainage and pavement markings on Little Mack Avenue from 12 Mile Road to 13 Mile Road, Macomb County. This is a Local Agency project.

5.00 % DBE participation required

15. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 031
Project: STU 82000-203523, ETC
Local Agreement: 19-5398
Start Date: 10 days after award
Completion Date: May 15, 2020
- Prequalification Level:
\$3,131,000.00

3.18 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing, concrete pavement repair, sidewalk and ramps, signing and pavement markings on Jefferson Avenue from Ecorse River Bridge to Outer Drive and from Outer Drive to River Rouge Bridge in the cities of Ecorse and River Rouge, Wayne County. This is a Local Agency project.

5.00 % DBE participation required

16. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 032
Project: STU 82000-203638
Local Agreement: 19-5393
Start Date: 10 days after award
Completion Date: June 1, 2020
- Prequalification Level:
\$1,826,000.00

Bridge replacement with a three-sided concrete box culvert, drainage, riprap, guardrail, approach work and pavement markings on Allen Road over Brownstown Creek, Wayne County. This is a Local Agency project.

4.00 % DBE participation required

17. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 033
Project: STU 81000-202645-2
Local Agreement: 19-5206
Start Date: 10 days after award
Completion Date: August 22, 2020
- Prequalification Level:
\$1,655,000.00
- 1.10 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing, concrete driveway, curb, gutter, sidewalk and ramps, drainage, signals and pavement markings on Carpenter Road from Ellsworth Road to Packard Street, Washtenaw County. This is a Local Agency project.
- 3.00 % DBE participation required
18. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 034
Project: STL 04141-130316
Local Agreement: 19-5390
Start Date: 10 days after award
Completion Date: June 19, 2020
- Prequalification Level:
\$1,221,000.00
- 2.01 mi of hot mix asphalt surfacing of gravel roadway and drainage on Wolf Creek Road from Scott Road north to Nicholson Hill Road, Alpena County. This is a Local Agency project.
- 3.00 % DBE participation required
19. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 035
Project: STU 70000-130710
Local Agreement: 19-5387
Start Date: 10 days after award
Completion Date: October 15, 2019
- Prequalification Level:
\$1,039,000.00
- 2.13 mi of hot mix asphalt resurfacing and construction of left turn lanes on 32nd Avenue from Byron Road to Quincy Street, Ottawa County. This is a Local Agency project.
- 3.00 % DBE participation required
20. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 036
Project: STU 41000-202881
Local Agreement: 19-5397
Start Date: September 3, 2019
Completion Date: June 30, 2020
- Prequalification Level:
\$610,000.00
- 1.00 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing, concrete curb and gutter, sidewalk ramps and pavement markings on Knapp Street from the east city limits of Grand Rapids to East Beltline (M-44), Kent County. This is a Local Agency project.
- 3.00 % DBE participation required

21. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 040
Project: TAL 15029-133276
Local Agreement: 19-5389
Start Date: 10 days after award
Completion Date: June 12, 2020

Prequalification Level:
\$1,616,000.00

6.50 mi of hot mix asphalt shared use path along Boyne Valley Trailway from Boyne City Airport to Railroad Street in the village of Boyne Falls, city of Boyne City, Charlevoix County. This is a Local Agency project.

4.00 % DBE participation required

22. Letting of August 9, 2019
Letting Call: 1908 041
Project: CM 80555-129837, ETC
Local Agreement: 19-5394
Start Date: 10 days after award
Completion Date: July 1, 2020

Prequalification Level:
\$1,214,000.00

1.03 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling, widening for shared use path and resurfacing, trenching, signing and pavement markings on Red Arrow Highway from 26th Street to 28th Street, Van Buren County. This is a Local Agency project.

3.00 % DBE participation required

On receipt of your approval, projects will, at the Director's discretion, be processed and awarded to the low bidder. I approve the project described in this agenda and authorize the award by the responsible management staff of MDOT to the extent authorized by and in accordance with the December 14, 1983, resolution of the State Transportation Commission and the Director's delegation memorandum of February 11, 2019.

Respectfully submitted,

Signed copy on file

Paul C. Ajegba, P.E.
Director

OFFICE MEMORANDUM

DATE: July 29, 2019

TO: State Transportation Commission

FROM: Jack Cotter, CPA, CGMA
Commission Auditor
Office of Commission Audits

SUBJECT: Justification Memorandums

Attached for your information are the department's justification memorandums for Exhibit A-2 items where the low bid exceeded the engineer's estimate by more than ten percent.

Signed Original on File

Jack Cotter, CPA, CGMA
Commission Auditor

Attachments

cc: T. Hagon

DATE: July 24, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: 3.30 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing, full-depth concrete pavement repairs, detail 7 joint and crack repairs, drainage, concrete curb and pavement markings on I-94 from 8 Mile Road easterly to 11 Mile Road in the cities of Eastpointe, Roseville, and St. Clair Shores, Macomb County.

Project Number: 50111-132111

Item Number: 1907 035

Low Bidder: Ajax Paving Industries, Inc.

Eng. Est: \$4,928,636.03 Low Bid: \$5,908,859.99 Difference: \$980,223.96 Percent: 19.89

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$4,928,636.03
Ajax Paving Industries, Inc.	\$5,908,859.99
Cadillac Asphalt, L.L.C.	\$7,022,751.93

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were hot mix asphalt approach; hot mix asphalt gap-graded superpave; pavement repair removal; pavement joint and crack repair; and minor traffic devices. These items were bid higher than normal due to maintaining traffic restrictions and a tight schedule. To minimize the impact to drivers, work can only be performed at night and on weekends. Since the project must be completed by the end of this construction season, the contractor has a very compact timeframe to complete the work, thereby increasing costs. The estimator considered these factors when estimating his project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of maintaining traffic restrictions and a tight schedule. This project received two bids of \$5,908,859.99 and \$7,022,751.93, which varied by 18.85 percent. We believe that rejecting this

July 24, 2019

bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the Macomb TSC request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
T. Sauter	S. Kotsonis	D. Grupido	S. Minton	K. Avery

BOD:DD:QA:DLP:raw

DATE: July 24, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: 2.22 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing inside two lanes of M-3 (Gratiot Road) from 14 Mile Road to Metropolitan Parkway (16 Mile Road), Macomb County.

Project Number: 50051-208203

Item Number: 1907 036

Low Bidder: Cadillac Asphalt, L.L.C.

Eng. Est: \$1,299,923.16 Low Bid: \$1,604,650.00 Difference: \$304,726.84 Percent: 23.44

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$1,299,923.16
Cadillac Asphalt, L.L.C.	\$1,604,650.00
Ajax Paving Industries, Inc.	\$1,609,927.01

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were cold milling hot mix asphalt surface and hot mix asphalt. These items were bid higher than normal due to maintaining traffic restrictions and a short construction schedule. The contractor is only allowed to work during nighttime hours and in one direction at one time. Additionally, the project can begin no earlier than August 10, 2019 and must be completed on or before September 8, 2019. These constraints limit the time in which work can be performed, creating additional risk for the contractor and increasing costs. The estimator considered these factors when estimating his project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of maintaining traffic restrictions and a short construction schedule. This project received two bids of \$1,604,650.00 and \$1,609,927.01, which varied by just 0.33 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the Macomb TSC request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
T. Sauter	S. Kotsonis	D. Grupido	S. Minton	K. Avery
K. Kirkpatrick				

BOD:DD:QA:DLP:raw

DATE: July 18, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: Deck maintenance including shallow overlay, deck joint replacement, deck patching, placing metal mesh panels, heat straightening one fascia beam and substructure patching with use of temporary supports, guardrail and reconstruction of approach work on Airline Road over US-31 and on I-96 over Airline Road in the city of Norton Shores, Muskegon County.

Project Number: 61152-204559

Item Number: 1907 037

Low Bidder: Anlaan Corporation

Eng. Est: \$1,225,310.19 Low Bid: \$1,428,358.45 Difference: \$203,048.26 Percent: 16.57

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$1,225,310.19
Anlaan Corporation	\$1,428,358.45
C. A. Hull Co., Inc.	\$1,664,427.05

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were hot mix asphalt approach, minor traffic devices, concrete grade D, expansion joint devices, metal mesh panels, concrete bridge deck overlay, scarifying, hydrodemolition and heat straightening steel items. These items were bid higher than normal due to repair work on four structures. Additionally, two bridges will be constructed in the fall of 2019, and two constructed spring of 2020. Spreading the work over two seasons lead to an increase in the cost of the major items of work, as the contractor will have to mobilize twice. The estimator considered these factors when estimating his project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of the construction schedule on multiple structures. This project received two bids of \$1,428,358.45

July 18, 2019

and \$1,664,427.05, which varied by 16.53 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the Muskegon TSC request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
J. DeRuyver	G. Zack	S. Rozema	E. Kind	M. Chynoweth
T. Sauter	K. Kirkpatrick			

BOD:DD:QA:RWC:raw

DATE: July 12, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: June 28, 2019

Project Description: 4.00 mi of hot mix asphalt crushing, shaping and resurfacing, guardrail and pavement markings on 7 Mile Road NW from Fruit Ridge Avenue to Alpine Avenue. Kent County.

Project Number: 41000-130692

Item Number: 1906 905

Low Bidder: Michigan Paving and Materials Company

Eng. Est: \$1,342,417.10 Low Bid: \$1,562,556.64 Difference: \$220,139.54 Percent: 16.40

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$1,342,417.10
Michigan Paving and Materials Company	\$1,562,556.64
Rieth-Riley Construction Co., Inc.	\$1,622,556.09

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main item found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were the hot mix asphalt pay items. These items were bid higher than normal due to the short schedule. All work is must be completed by September 14, 2019. The schedule is necessary to accommodate other work in the area. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of a tight work schedule. This project received two bids, of \$1,562,556.64 and \$1,622,556.09, which varied by 3.84 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the Kent County Road Commission request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
R. Levine	N. Vandrunen	S. Rozema	E. Kind	T. Sauter

BOD:DD:QA:RWC:raw

DATE: July 15, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: June 28, 2019

Project Description: 1.83 mi of hot mix asphalt shared use path includes grading, earthwork, retaining wall, viewing platform and slope restoration on along West Burt Lake Road to Riggsville Road, Cheboygan County.

Project Number: 16000-200053

Item Number: 1906 907

Low Bidder: J & N Construction, LLC

Eng. Est: \$625,538.50 Low Bid: \$697,758.44 Difference: \$72,219.94 Percent: 11.55

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$625,538.50
J & N Construction, LLC	\$697,758.44
Malley Construction, Inc.	\$719,583.30
Elmer's Crane and Dozer, Inc.	\$786,804.50
Rieth-Riley Construction Co., Inc.	\$826,739.00
M & M Excavating Company	\$839,000.00

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were the shared use path pay items. These items were bid higher than normal due to the maintaining traffic constraints and use of a unique item. All work must be performed during daylight hours. The contractor is required to maintain access at all times to all commercial and residential driveways throughout the project and must be completed by November 1st. Additionally, the pay item shared use path, grading, special is a unique item with little bid history, making the price hard to predict. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of maintaining traffic constraints and a unique pay item. This project received five bids, ranging from \$697,758.44 to \$839,000.00, which varied by 20.24 percent. The two lowest bids varied by

just 3.13 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the Cheboygan County Road Commission request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
L. Johnson	B. Swanson	G. Deans	S. Thayer	T. Sauter

BOD:DD:QA:RWC:raw

DATE: July 12, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: June 28, 2019

Project Description: 0.91 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing, adjust drainage structures, concrete sidewalk ramps, slope restoration and pavement markings on various routes, Marquette County.

Project Number: 52000-133036

Item Number: 1906 908

Low Bidder: Payne & Dolan Inc.

Eng. Est: \$506,282.80 Low Bid: \$723,815.85 Difference: \$217,533.05 Percent: 42.97

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$506,282.80
Payne & Dolan Inc.	\$723,815.85
Bacco Construction Company	\$756,635.14

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were the hot mix asphalt pay items, sidewalk ramp and traffic regulator control. These items were bid higher than normal due to multiple locations. This project takes place at 6 different locations throughout the city of Negaunee. The non-production work likely caused an increase in cost to the hot mix asphalt and sidewalk ramp pay items because the contractor must move multiple times. Furthermore, the maintaining traffic requires the contractor to provide a detour for approximately 3 weeks, as well as provide intermittent traffic regulator control, and providing traffic regulator control at each of the 6 locations. The specific staging at multiple locations led to an increase in cost to the traffic control pay item. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of staging restrictions, multiple locations, and non-production work. This project received two bids of \$723,815.85 to \$756,635.14, which varied by 4.53 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and

re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the city of Negaunee request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
R. Levine	A. Anderson	M. Maloney	A. Johnson	T. Sauter

BOD:DD:QA:RWC:raw

DATE: July 9, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: June 28, 2019

Project Description: 15.82 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing, concrete curb and gutter, sidewalk, sidewalk ramps, drainage and pavement markings on various routes in the city of Detroit, Wayne County

Project Number: 82000-205935

Item Number: 1906 912

Low Bidder: Ajax Paving Industries, Inc.

Eng. Est: \$11,902,776.77 Low Bid: \$14,761,888.88 Difference: \$2,859,112.11 Percent: 24.02

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$11,902,776.77
Ajax Paving Industries, Inc.	\$14,761,888.88
Cadillac Asphalt, L.L.C.	\$14,936,120.97

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were for the pavement cleaning, hot mix asphalt; minor traffic devices; and traffic regulator control. These items were bid higher than normal due to traffic control items and location of the project. This project is located city wide. The staging of multiple work operations will occur simultaneously across several corridors throughout the city for the duration of the project. This will require significant mobilization/remobilization of traffic controls, increasing costs. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of the increased traffic control and the inflation of hot mix asphalt cost. This project received two bids of \$14,761,888.88 and \$14,936,120.97, which varied by 1.18 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the city of Detroit request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
G. Masinda	S. Paris	S. Minton	K. Avery	T. Sauter

BOD:DD:QA:SF:raw

DATE: July 18, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: 1.79 mi of hot mix asphalt surface removal and resurfacing, shared use path, concrete curb and gutter, sidewalk, sidewalk ramp, culverts, sewer drainage, modular block retaining wall, concrete barrier wall, ditching, concrete pavement repairs, guardrail and pavement markings on southbound Northwestern Highway Service Drive from Civic Center Drive to 9 Mile Road in the city of Southfield, Oakland County.

Project Number: 63000-203636-2

Item Number: 1907 005

Low Bidder: DiPonio Contracting, Inc.

Eng. Est: \$3,631,832.70 Low Bid: \$4,325,356.03 Difference: \$693,523.33 Percent: 19.10

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$3,631,832.70
DiPonio Contracting, Inc.	\$4,325,356.03
Dan's Excavating, Inc.	\$4,540,906.86
Major Cement Co.	\$4,642,083.53
Cipparrone Contracting, Inc./Verdeterre Contracting, Inc.	\$4,787,581.87

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were earth excavation, aggregate base items, hot mix asphalt items, pavement joint and crack repair, pavement repair items, concrete grade D and pathway grading. These items were bid higher than normal due to site constraints at the project location. This project is along the Northwestern Highway Service Drive with a high volume of traffic. Additionally, there are numerous utilities the contractor must work around, which is labor intensive and involves non-production work due to the staging and traffic constraints, increasing the cost to these items. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of location constraints. This project received four bids, ranging from \$4,325,356.03 to \$4,787,581.87, which varied by 10.69 percent. The two lowest bids varied by just 4.98 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the city of Southfield request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
K. Avery	B. Schriner	L. Swanson	S. Minton	K. Kirkpatrick
T. Sauter				

BOD:DD:QA:RWC:raw

DATE: July 22, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019
Project Description: Installation of reflectorized backplates, tethers and signal modernization on M-97 at various intersections, Macomb County.
Project Number: 50031-203267
Item Number: 1907 008
Low Bidder: J. Ranck Electric, Inc.

Eng. Est: \$765,669.40 Low Bid: \$847,508.10 Difference: \$81,838.70 Percent: 10.69

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$765,669.40
J. Ranck Electric, Inc.	\$847,508.10
Motor City Electric Utilities Company	\$932,568.95
Rauhorn Electric, Inc.	\$1,125,516.39
Dan's Excavating, Inc.	\$1,274,044.66

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were modified span wire tether and video traffic detection system. These items were bid higher than normal due to the unique items of work. The modified span wire tethers is a unique item because it will be installed with just back plates. This will require a very mobile operation, with multiple stages for each approach within an intersection. In addition, the video traffic detection system is a unique item with little bid history because it includes the installation and setup labor of all new detection equipment. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of unique items of work. This project received four bids, ranging from \$847,508.10 to \$1,274,044.66, which varied by 50.33 percent. The two lowest bids varied by 10.04 percent. We believe that

rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the Macomb County Department of Roads request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
T. Sauter	P. Blazo	D. Grupido	S. Minton	K. Avery

BOD:DD:QA:RWC:raw

DATE: July 22, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: Substructure repairs, replace deck joint and hot mix asphalt wearing course, deck waterproofing membrane, beam repair, fascia beam concrete surface coating and approach work on various routes over the Thornapple River, Barry County.

Project Number: 08000-133074

Item Number: 1907 010

Low Bidder: Anlaan Corporation

Eng. Est: \$450,181.28 Low Bid: \$536,120.73 Difference: \$85,939.45 Percent: 19.09

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$450,181.28
Anlaan Corporation	\$536,120.73
Grand River Construction, Inc.	\$549,291.58
C. A. Hull Co., Inc.	\$778,885.29

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were modified hot mix asphalt surface removal; hot mix asphalt; and minor traffic devices. These items were bid higher than normal due to multiple sites and special requirements in the maintenance of traffic. This project consists of four bridges throughout Barry County. Each location has only small quantities of work to be performed. This limits production, increasing costs. In addition, the contractor is required to maintain various detour routes throughout the county, working around special events and festivals. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of multiple sites and special maintenance of traffic requirements. This project received three bids, ranging from \$536,120.73 to \$778,885.29, which varied by 45.28 percent. The lowest two bids varied by 2.46 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the Barry County Road Commission request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
T. Sauter	P. Rojas	K. Stein	S. Rozema	M. Chynoweth
E. Kind				

BOD:DD:QA:DLP:raw

DATE: July 24, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: 0.56 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing, concrete base course patching, full depth pavement repair, curb, gutter, sidewalk and ramps, signing, drainage, landscaping and pavement markings on Cadieux Road from Kercheval Avenue to Mack Avenue in the cities of Grosse Pointe Park and Grosse Pointe, Wayne County.

Project Number: 82000-203501

Item Number: 1907 018

Low Bidder: Cipparrone Contracting, Inc.

Eng. Est: \$687,208.00 Low Bid: \$808,258.74 Difference: \$121,050.74 Percent: 17.61

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$687,208.00
Cipparrone Contracting, Inc.	\$808,258.74
Major Cement Co.	\$908,438.32

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were modified pavement removal, earthwork items, hot mix asphalt items, sidewalk ramp and minor traffic devices. These items were bid higher than normal due to non-production work. Most of the work on this project takes place in small areas. This non-production work is more labor intensive than when this work can be done in larger areas, leading to an increase in cost. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of non-production work. This project received two bids of \$808,258.74 and \$908,438.32, which varied by 12.39 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the city of Grosse Pointe request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
T. Sauter	S. Paris	S. Minton	K. Avery	K. Kirkpatrick
R. Levine				

BOD:DD:QA:RWC:raw

DATE: July 18, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: 3.82 mi of hot mix asphalt crushing, shaping and resurfacing, trenching, ditch cleanout, aggregate shoulders, drainage and pavement markings on Capac Road from north of Hough Road north to south of Terry Road, St. Clair County.

Project Number: 77000-133405

Item Number: 1907 021

Low Bidder: J & N Construction, LLC

Eng. Est: \$3,025,427.22 Low Bid: \$3,627,572.48 Difference: \$602,145.26 Percent: 19.90

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$3,025,427.22
J & N Construction, LLC	\$3,627,572.48
Boddy Construction Company, Inc.	\$3,851,061.54
Superior Contracting Group L.L.C.	\$3,864,005.70
Dan's Excavating, Inc.	\$3,954,927.17
Raymond Excavating Company	\$4,163,848.63

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were aggregate base modified, millings base, asphalt base stabilization, hot mix asphalt items, minor traffic devices, slope restoration and asphalt cement binder. These items were bid higher than normal due to the project schedule, location, and unique pay items. This project has a condensed schedule to minimize disturbances and inconveniences to motorists and residents. Since there are no material suppliers in the vicinity, additional trucking costs are needed. Furthermore, the modified aggregate base, millings base, asphalt base stabilization and asphalt cement binder are all unique items with little or no bid history. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of the project schedule, location, and unique pay items. This project received five bids, ranging from \$3,627,572.48 to \$4,163,848.63, which varied by 14.78 percent. The three lowest bids varied by 6.52 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the St. Clair County Road Commission request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
J. Garza	D. Spencley	T. Anderson	R. Ranck	K. Kirkpatrick
T. Sauter				

BOD:DD:QA:RWC:raw

DATE: July 24, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: 1.50 mi of hot mix asphalt resurfacing, machine grading, aggregate base, concrete driveway, curb and gutter, storm sewer, retaining wall, signing and pavement markings on North Shore Drive from the Grand Haven city limit to Main Street and from the Ferrysburg city limit to North Shore Park and on Piney Pointe Drive from North Shore Drive to the cul de sac in the city of Grand Haven, Ottawa County.

Project Number: 70000-130778-2

Item Number: 1907 023

Low Bidder: Milbocker and Sons, Inc.

Eng. Est: \$2,518,627.00 Low Bid: \$3,199,944.08 Difference: \$681,317.08 Percent: 27.05

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$2,518,627.00
Milbocker and Sons, Inc.	\$3,199,944.08
Al's Excavating, Inc.	\$3,439,178.55
Kamminga & Roodvoets, Inc.	\$3,652,946.05

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were modified 8 inch aggregate base; segmental block retaining wall; and minor traffic devices. These items were bid higher than normal due to the project location and a unique item of work. This project is located along a lengthy dead-end roadway. This creates difficulties for the contractor to haul in and spreading down materials, as well as maintaining access to numerous homes and businesses at all times. In addition, this project is in a critical dune area and will require unique protection and restoration with proper materials to prevent wind and soil erosion. The segmental block retaining wall is a unique item of work, making it challenging to price. The local agency estimator considered these factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of the location of the project and a unique item of work. This project received three bids, ranging from \$3,199,944.08 to \$3,652,946.05, which varied by 14.16 percent. The lowest two bids varied by 7.48 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the city of Grand Haven request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
T. Sauter	G. Zack	S. Rozema	E. Kind	K. Kirkpatrick
A. Zokvic				

BOD:DD:QA:DLP:raw

DATE: July 24, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: 10.60 mi of hot mix asphalt crushing, shaping and resurfacing, shoulders, drainage and pavement markings on Curley Lewis Highway from Salt Point Road to M-123, Chippewa County.

Project Number: 17555-130389

Item Number: 1907 024

Low Bidder: Payne & Dolan Inc.

Eng. Est: \$1,869,734.23 Low Bid: \$2,221,327.86 Difference: \$351,593.63 Percent: 18.80

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$1,869,734.23
Payne & Dolan Inc.	\$2,221,327.86
Bacco Construction Company	\$2,262,311.51

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were aggregate shoulder and hot mix asphalt. These items were bid higher than normal due to the project's location. This project is located in a remote area of the upper peninsula. There are limited resources available to mobilize the work force, increasing the cost of transporting equipment and materials to the site. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of the project's location. This project received two bids of \$2,221,327.86 and \$2,262,311.51, which varied by 1.85 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the Chippewa County Road Commission request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
M. Duell	D. Rusch	M. Maloney	A. Johnson	K.Kirkpatrick
T. Sauter				

BOD:DD:QA:DLP:raw

DATE: July 24, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: Superstructure replacement, scour protection and approach work on Shepard Road over the Chippewa River, Isabella County.

Project Number: 37000-133029

Item Number: 1907 025

Low Bidder: Anlaan Corporation

Eng. Est: \$1,096,278.30 Low Bid: \$1,348,040.93 Difference: \$251,762.63 Percent: 22.97

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$1,096,278.30
Anlaan Corporation	\$1,348,040.93
Grand River Construction, Inc.	\$1,499,854.62
C. A. Hull Co., Inc.	\$1,910,772.88

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were structures removal and superstructure concrete night casting. These items were bid higher than normal due to the project schedule. This project has an expedited schedule. All work, other than final site restoration and clean-up, is required to be completed before November 8th. The local agency estimator considered this factor when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of the project schedule. This project received three bids, ranging from \$1,348,040.93 to \$1,910,772.88, which varied by 41.74 percent. The two lowest bids varied by 11.26 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the Isabella County Road Commission request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
T. Sauter	C. Lorenz	J. Garza	R. Ranck	K. Kirkpatrick
T. Barry				

BOD:DD:QA:RWC:raw

DATE: July 24, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: 2.75 mi of hot mix asphalt overlay, shoulder aggregate, guardrail, signing and pavement markings on Grange Hall Road from Van Road to Jossman Road, Oakland County.

Project Number: 63000-205174

Item Number: 1907 026

Low Bidder: Ace-Saginaw Paving Company

Eng. Est: \$739,386.25 Low Bid: \$930,060.39 Difference: \$190,674.14 Percent: 25.79

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$739,386.25
Ace-Saginaw Paving Company	\$930,060.39
Cadillac Asphalt, L.L.C.	\$958,328.30
Ajax Paving Industries, Inc.	\$1,157,700.41

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were earth excavation, RCOC; shoulder, 21AA; hot mix asphalt items; guardrail, type B and traffic regulator control. These items were bid higher than normal due to the unique items and project constraints. Excavation, earth, RCOC and shoulder, 21AA are unique items with limited history. The hot mix asphalt milling, and paving work is non-uniform through the project, leading to less production work and higher costs. Most of the guardrail installation requires the use of longer than typical post. Additionally, the guardrail installation is over a mile in length and will take substantially more time to install. This will increase the amount of regulator control required, leading to increases in cost to those two items. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of the unique pay items and project constraints. This project received three bids of \$930,060.39 to \$1,157,700.41, which varied by 24.48 percent. The two lowest bids varied by just 3.04 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the Road Commission for Oakland County request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
T. Sauter	L. Swanson	S. Minton	K. Avery	K. Kirkpatrick
R. Levine				

BOD:DD:QA:RWC:raw

DATE: July 24, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: 0.32 mi of hot mix asphalt pavement widening, concrete pavement, curb, gutter and sidewalk ramps, drainage, signals and pavement markings on Six Mile Road at Beck Road, Wayne County.

Project Number: 82000-207796

Item Number: 1907 029

Low Bidder: Cipparrone Contracting, Inc.

Eng. Est: \$576,354.50 Low Bid: \$731,468.20 Difference: \$155,113.70 Percent: 26.91

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$576,354.50
Cipparrone Contracting, Inc.	\$731,468.20
Dan's Excavating, Inc.	\$763,963.84
C & D Hughes, Inc.	\$829,805.22

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were miscellaneous underdrain, subgrade, shallow, 6 inch; miscellaneous concrete pavement, nonreinforced, ISC-3, 10 inch; minor traffic devices; and traffic regulator control. These items were bid higher than normal due to unique items of work and an expedited schedule. The miscellaneous underdrain and miscellaneous nonreinforced ISC-3 concrete pavement are unique items of work with limited bid history to effectively compare prices. In addition, construction work will be completed in two phases. Phase I cannot begin until September 16, 2019 and must be substantially completed by October 31, 2019. Phase II cannot begin until April 15, 2020, and the entire project must be completed by June 1, 2020. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of the unique items of work and an expedited schedule. This project received three bids ranging from \$731,468.20 and \$829,805.22, which varied by 13.44 percent. The two lowest bids varied by 4.44 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the Wayne County Department of Public Services request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
T. Sauter	A. Zokvic	A. Penzenstadler	S. Minton	K. Avery

BOD:DD:QA:DLP:raw

DATE: July 18, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: 6.72 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing, concrete curb and gutter, sidewalk ramps and pavement markings on various routes, Washtenaw County.

Project Number: 81000-202692

Item Number: 1907 032

Low Bidder: Cadillac Asphalt, L.L.C.

Eng. Est: \$1,620,507.30 Low Bid: \$1,871,400.00 Difference: \$250,892.70 Percent: 15.48

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$1,620,507.30
Cadillac Asphalt, L.L.C.	\$1,871,400.00
Ajax Paving Industries, Inc	\$2,521,205.83

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main item found to be higher than the engineer's estimate was hot mix asphalt. This item was bid higher than normal due to multiple locations, and a two-season construction schedule. This project involves five different roadways throughout Washtenaw County. This will require the contractor to mobilize equipment multiple times during construction. In addition, work will occur over two construction seasons. This causes uncertainties for the contractor with the potential for increases in material prices and wages. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of multiple locations and a two-season construction schedule. This project received two bids of \$1,871,400.00 and \$2,521,205.83, which varied by 34.72 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the Washtenaw County Road Commission request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
B. Chomas	J. Daavettila	J. Reid	D. Parker	K. Kirkpatrick
T. Sauter				

BOD:DD:QA:DLP:raw

DATE: July 24, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: 0.40 mi of hot mix asphalt removal and resurfacing, culvert replacement, storm sewer, guardrail, riprap and pavement markings on various routes at 13 locations, Midland County.

Project Number: 56000-203306

Item Number: 1907 033

Low Bidder: The Isabella Corporation

Eng. Est: \$786,578.00 Low Bid: \$916,364.01 Difference: \$129,786.01 Percent: 16.50

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$786,587.00
The Isabella Corporation	\$916,364.01
Wonsey Tree Service, Inc.	\$923,584.79
Malley Construction, Inc.	\$938,032.07
Shaw Contracting Co.	\$987,955.40
Crawford Contracting, Inc.	\$1,017,150.32
Tr-City Groundbreakers, Inc.	\$1,144,184.00

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were hot mix asphalt approach and traffic control. These items were bid higher than normal due to multiple locations. This project is countywide with 13 separate locations. The repair is different at each location, but all require traffic control and hot mix asphalt approach work. This will require the contractor to set up work and transport equipment and materials multiple times with only small amounts of work at each location, increasing costs. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of multiple project locations. This project received six bids, ranging from \$916,364.01 to \$1,144,184.00, which varied by 24.86 percent. The three lowest bids varied by just 2.36 percent.

We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the Midland County Road Commission request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
T. Sauter	D. Spencley	C. Lorenz	J. Garza	R. Ranck

BOD:DD:QA:RWC:raw

DATE: July 18, 2019

TO: Patrick J. McCarthy, Director
Bureau of Finance and Administration

FROM: Bradley C. Wieferich, Director
Bureau of Development

SUBJECT: Justification Memo for Bid Acceptance in Excess of 10 Percent of Engineer Estimate

Letting Date: July 12, 2019

Project Description: 0.50 mi of hot mix asphalt pavement widening, aggregate base, storm sewer, concrete pavement, curb, gutter, sidewalk and ramps, signals, water main, bridge rehabilitation with 36 inch prestressed concrete bulb-tee beams, steel sheet piling and pavement markings on 54th Street from Haughey Avenue to US-131 in the city of Wyoming, Kent County.

Project Number: 41000-130613

Item Number: 1907 034

Low Bidder: Kamminga & Roodvoets, Inc.

Eng. Est: \$1,255,438.56 Low Bid: \$1,458,847.55 Difference: \$203,408.99 Percent: 16.20

The following shows the engineer's estimate and the proposed bids received for this project:

Engineer's Estimate	\$1,255,438.56
Kamminga & Roodvoets, Inc.	\$1,458,847.55
Anlaan Corporation	\$1,487,193.41
Michigan Paving and Materials Company	\$1,965,970.89

EXPLANATION FOR DIFFERENCES

The low bidder had unit prices that varied from the normal range. The main items found to be higher than the engineer's estimate were superstructure concrete, form, finish, and cure, night casting; modified machine grading; and minor traffic devices. These items were bid higher than normal due to a unique item of work and the project schedule. Modified machine grading is a unique item of work and difficult to effectively price. Additionally, the superstructure and final lawn restoration must be completed by November 15, 2019. The compressed timeline at the end of the construction season causes additional risk for the contractor to meet this deadline, increasing the cost. The local agency estimator considered several factors when estimating this project but was unable to precisely predict the unit prices.

OVERALL CONCLUSION

As indicated in the above analysis, the low bid is over the engineer's estimate because of a unique item of work and the project schedule. This project received three bids, ranging from \$1,458,847.55 to \$1,965,970.89, which varied by 34.76 percent. The lowest two bids varied by 1.94 percent. We believe that rejecting this bid and re-letting this project will not result in lower bids, and the low bid should be considered reasonable, based on the factors discussed.

The Bureau of Development and the city of Wyoming request that this project be awarded to the low bidder, based on the above conclusion.

Director, Bureau of Development

cc: J. Cotter	D. Harr	S. Thurman	T. Kratofil	Director Ajegba
V. Lake	R. Welter	L. Strzalka	C. Rademacher	MDOT-eProposal
K. Schuster	J. Hinkle	M. Shulick	C. Tennes	R. Worgess-Carveth
S. Fedders	D. Potvin	H. Stinson	K. Curtis	K. Farlin
L. Bretz	C. Masseau	B. Rottiers	J. Gutting	E. Poole
A. Zokvic	N. Vandrunen	S. Rozema	E. Kind	K. Kirkpatrick
T. Sauter				

BOD:DD:QA:DLP:raw

REQUEST FOR MICHIGAN STATE
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION APPROVAL
LETTING EXCEPTIONS AGENDA

August 6, 2019

STATE PROJECTS

1. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 035
 Project: IM 50111-132111
 Local Agreement:
 Start Date: August 12, 2019
 Completion Date: November 16, 2019
- Low Bid: **\$5,908,859.99**
 Engineer Estimate: \$4,928,636.03
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 19.89 %

3.30 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing, full-depth concrete pavement repairs, detail 7 joint and crack repairs, drainage, concrete curb and pavement markings on I-94 from 8 Mile Road easterly to 11 Mile Road in the cities of Eastpointe, Roseville, and St. Clair Shores, Macomb County. This project includes a 3-year materials and workmanship pavement warranty.

4.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Ajax Paving Industries, Inc.	\$5,908,859.99	Same	1 **
Cadillac Asphalt, L.L.C.	\$7,022,751.93	Same	2

Total Number of Bidders: 2

2. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 036
 Project: M 50051-208203
 Local Agreement:
 Start Date: August 10, 2019
 Completion Date: September 8, 2019
- Low Bid: **\$1,604,650.00**
 Engineer Estimate: \$1,299,923.16
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 23.44 %

2.22 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing inside two lanes of M-3 (Gratiot Road) from 14 Mile Road to Metropolitan Parkway (16 Mile Road), Macomb County.

0.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Cadillac Asphalt, L.L.C.	\$1,604,650.00	Same	1 **
Ajax Paving Industries, Inc.	\$1,609,927.01	Same	2

Total Number of Bidders: 2

3. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 037
 Project: M 61152-204559
 Local Agreement:
 Start Date: September 4, 2019
 Completion Date: October 19, 2020
- Low Bid: **\$1,428,358.45**
 Engineer Estimate: \$1,225,310.19
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 16.57 %

Deck maintenance including shallow overlay, deck joint replacement, deck patching, placing metal mesh panels, heat straightening one fascia beam and substructure patching with use of temporary supports, guardrail and reconstruction of approach work on Airline Road over US-31 and on I-96 over Airline Road in the city of Norton Shores, Muskegon County.

0.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Anlaan Corporation	\$1,428,358.45	Same	1 **
C. A. Hull Co., Inc.	\$1,664,427.05	Same	2

Total Number of Bidders: 2

4. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 038
 Project: HSIP 81104-124063
 Local Agreement:
 Start Date: 10 days after award
 Completion Date: January 3, 2020
- Low Bid: **\$569,138.11**
 Engineer Estimate: \$548,006.18
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 3.86 %

4.65 mi of horizontal curve treatment, epoxy overlay, dynamic warning system and pavement markings on various routes, Eaton, Ingham, Lenawee, Livingston and Washtenaw Counties.

0.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Smith's Waterproofing LLC	\$569,138.11	Same	1 **

Total Number of Bidders: 1

LOCAL PROJECTS

5. Letting of June 28, 2019
 Letting Call: 1906 905
 Project: STL 41000-130692
 Local Agreement: 19-5293
 Start Date: July 1, 2019
 Completion Date: September 14, 2019
- Low Bid: **\$1,562,556.64**
 Engineer Estimate: \$1,342,417.10
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 16.40 %

4.00 mi of hot mix asphalt crushing, shaping and resurfacing, guardrail and pavement markings on 7 Mile Road NW from Fruit Ridge Avenue to Alpine Avenue. Kent County. This is a Local Agency project.

3.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Michigan Paving and Materials Company	\$1,562,556.64	Same	1 **
Rieth-Riley Construction Co., Inc.	\$1,622,556.09	Same	2

Total Number of Bidders: 2

6. Letting of June 28, 2019
 Letting Call: 1906 907
 Project: TAL 16000-200053
 Local Agreement: 19-5280
 Start Date: 10 days after award
 Completion Date: November 1, 2019
- Low Bid: **\$697,758.44**
 Engineer Estimate: \$625,538.50
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 11.55 %

1.83 mi of hot mix asphalt shared use path includes grading, earthwork, retaining wall, viewing platform and slope restoration on along West Burt Lake Road to Riggsville Road, Cheboygan County. This is a Local Agency project.

4.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
J & N Construction, LLC	\$697,758.44	Same	1 **
Malley Construction, Inc.	\$719,583.30	Same	2
Elmer's Crane and Dozer, Inc.	\$786,804.50	Same	3
Rieth-Riley Construction Co., Inc.	\$826,739.00	Same	4
M & M Excavating Company	\$839,000.00	Same	5

Total Number of Bidders: 5

7. Letting of June 28, 2019
 Letting Call: 1906 908
 Project: STUL 52000-133036
 Local Agreement: 19-5277
 Start Date: August 5, 2019
 Completion Date: October 31, 2019
- Low Bid: **\$723,815.85**
 Engineer Estimate: \$506,282.80
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 42.97 %

0.91 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing. Adjust drainage structures, concrete sidewalk ramps, slope restoration and pavement markings on various routes, Marquette County. This is a Local Agency project.

0.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Payne & Dolan Inc.	\$723,815.85	Same	1 **
Bacco Construction Company	\$756,635.14	Same	2

Total Number of Bidders: 2

8. Letting of June 28, 2019
 Letting Call: 1906 912
 Project: NH 82000-205935, ETC
 Local Agreement: 19-5309
 Start Date: 10 days after award
 Completion Date: September 30, 2020
- Low Bid: **\$14,761,888.88**
 Engineer Estimate: \$11,902,776.77
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 24.02 %

15.82 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing, concrete curb and gutter, sidewalk, sidewalk ramps, drainage and pavement markings on various routes in the city of Detroit, Wayne County. This is a Local Agency project.

4.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Ajax Paving Industries, Inc.	\$14,761,888.88	Same	1 **
Cadillac Asphalt, L.L.C.	\$14,936,120.97	Same	2

Total Number of Bidders: 2

9. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 005
 Project: STU 63000-203636-2, ETC
 Local Agreement: 19-5151, 19-5318
 Start Date: August 16, 2019
 Completion Date: September 25, 2020
- Low Bid: **\$4,325,356.03**
 Engineer Estimate: \$3,631,832.70
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 19.10 %

1.79 mi of hot mix asphalt surface removal and resurfacing, shared use path, concrete curb and gutter, sidewalk, sidewalk ramp, culverts, sewer drainage, modular block retaining wall, concrete barrier wall, ditching, concrete pavement repairs, guardrail and pavement markings on southbound Northwestern Highway Service Drive from Civic Center Drive to 9 Mile Road in the city of Southfield, Oakland County. This is a Local Agency project.

5.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
DiPonio Contracting, Inc.	\$4,325,356.03	Same	1 **
Dan's Excavating, Inc.	\$4,540,906.86	Same	2
Major Cement Co.	\$4,642,083.53	Same	3
Cipparrone Contracting/Verdeterre Contracting	\$4,787,581.87	Same	4

Total Number of Bidders: 4

10. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 008
 Project: HSIP 50031-203267
 Local Agreement: 19-5317
 Start Date: November 1, 2019
 Completion Date: July 15, 2020
- Low Bid: **\$847,508.10**
 Engineer Estimate: \$765,669.40
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 10.69 %

Installation of reflectorized backplates, tethers and signal modernization on M-97 at various intersections, Macomb County. This is a Local Agency project.

0.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
J. Ranck Electric, Inc.	\$847,508.10	Same	1 **
Motor City Electric Utilities Company	\$932,568.95	Same	2
Rauhorn Electric, Inc.	\$1,125,516.39	Same	3
Dan's Excavating, Inc.	\$1,274,044.66	Same	4

Total Number of Bidders: 4

11. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 010
 Project: BHT 08000-133074, ETC
 Local Agreement: 19-5313
 Start Date: 10 days after award
 Completion Date: October 25, 2019

Low Bid: **\$536,120.73**
 Engineer Estimate: \$450,181.28
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 19.09 %

Substructure repairs, replace deck joint and hot mix asphalt wearing course, deck waterproofing membrane, beam repair, fascia beam concrete surface coating and approach work on various routes over the Thornapple River, Barry County. This is a Local Agency project.

0.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Anlaan Corporation	\$536,120.73	Same	1 **
Grand River Construction, Inc.	\$549,291.58	Same	2
C. A. Hull Co., Inc.	\$778,885.29	Same	3

Total Number of Bidders: 3

12. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 018
 Project: TA 82000-203501, ETC
 Local Agreement: 19-5312, 19-5360
 Start Date: 10 days after award
 Completion Date: November 15, 2019

Low Bid: **\$808,258.74**
 Engineer Estimate: \$687,208.00
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 17.61 %

0.56 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing, concrete base course patching, full depth pavement repair, curb, gutter, sidewalk and ramps, signing, drainage, landscaping and pavement markings on Cadieux Road from Kercheval Avenue to Mack Avenue in the cities of Grosse Pointe Park and Grosse Pointe, Wayne County. This is a Local Agency project.

5.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Cipparrone Contracting, Inc.	\$808,258.74	Same	1 **
Major Cement Co.	\$908,438.32	Same	2

Total Number of Bidders: 2

13. Letting of July 12, 2019
Letting Call: 1907 021
Project: EMRP 77000-133405
Local Agreement: 19-5361
Start Date: 10 days after award
Completion Date: June 26, 2020

Low Bid: **\$3,627,572.48**
Engineer Estimate: \$3,025,427.22
Pct Over/Under Estimate: 19.90 %

3.82 mi of hot mix asphalt crushing, shaping and resurfacing, trenching, ditch cleanout, aggregate shoulders, drainage and pavement markings on Capac Road from north of Hough Road north to south of Terry Road, St. Clair County. This is a Local Agency project.

3.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
J & N Construction, LLC	\$3,627,572.48	Same	1 **
Boddy Construction Company, Inc.	\$3,851,061.54	Same	2
Superior Contracting Group L.L.C.	\$3,864,005.70	Same	3
Dan's Excavating, Inc.	\$3,954,927.17	Same	4
Raymond Excavating Company	\$4,163,848.63	Same	5

Total Number of Bidders: 5

14. Letting of July 12, 2019
Letting Call: 1907 023
Project: STUL 70000-130778-2
Local Agreement: 19-5137, 19-5138
Start Date: September 3, 2019
Completion Date: July 17, 2020

Low Bid: **\$3,199,944.08**
Engineer Estimate: \$2,518,627.00
Pct Over/Under Estimate: 27.05 %

1.50 mi of hot mix asphalt resurfacing, machine grading, aggregate base, concrete driveway, curb and gutter, storm sewer, retaining wall, signing and pavement markings on North Shore Drive from the Grand Haven city limit to Main Street and from the Ferrysburg city limit to North Shore Park and on Piney Pointe Drive from North Shore Drive to the cul-de-sac in the city of Grand Haven, Ottawa County. This is a Local Agency project.

3.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Milbocker and Sons, Inc.	\$3,199,944.08	Same	1 **
Al's Excavating, Inc.	\$3,439,178.55	Same	2
Kamminga & Roodvoets, Inc.	\$3,652,946.05	Same	3

Total Number of Bidders: 3

15. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 024
 Project: FLAP 17555-130389
 Local Agreement: 19-5328
 Start Date: 10 days after award
 Completion Date: July 3, 2020

Low Bid: **\$2,221,327.86**
 Engineer Estimate: \$1,869,734.23
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 18.80 %

10.60 mi of hot mix asphalt crushing, shaping and resurfacing, shoulders, drainage and pavement markings on Curley Lewis Highway from Salt Point Road to M-123, Chippewa County. This is a Local Agency project.

2.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Payne & Dolan Inc.	\$2,221,327.86	Same	1 **
Bacco Construction Company	\$2,262,311.51	Same	2

Total Number of Bidders: 2

16. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 025
 Project: BO 37000-133029
 Local Agreement: 19-5299
 Start Date: 10 days after award
 Completion Date: June 5, 2020

Low Bid: **\$1,348,040.93**
 Engineer Estimate: \$1,096,278.30
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 22.97 %

Superstructure replacement scour protection and approach work on Shepard Road over the Chippewa River, Isabella County. This is a Local Agency project.

3.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Anlaan Corporation	\$1,348,040.93	Same	1 **
Grand River Construction, Inc.	\$1,499,854.62	Same	2
C. A. Hull Co., Inc.	\$1,910,772.88	Same	3

Total Number of Bidders: 3

17. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 026
 Project: STL 63000-205174
 Local Agreement: 19-5334
 Start Date: 10 days after award
 Completion Date: June 19, 2020

Low Bid: **\$930,060.39**
 Engineer Estimate: \$739,386.25
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 25.79 %

2.75 mi of hot mix asphalt overlay, shoulder aggregate, guardrail, signing and pavement markings on Grange Hall Road from Van Road to Jossman Road, Oakland County. This is a Local Agency project.

3.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Ace-Saginaw Paving Company	\$930,060.39	Same	1 **
Cadillac Asphalt, L.L.C.	\$958,328.30	Same	2
Ajax Paving Industries, Inc.	\$1,157,700.41	Same	3

Total Number of Bidders: 3

18. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 029
 Project: CPM 82000-207796
 Local Agreement: 19-5321
 Start Date: 10 days after award
 Completion Date: June 1, 2020

Low Bid: **\$731,468.20**
 Engineer Estimate: \$576,354.50
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 26.91 %

0.32 mi of hot mix asphalt pavement widening, concrete pavement, curb, gutter and sidewalk ramps, drainage, signals and pavement markings on Six Mile Road at Beck Road, Wayne County. This is a Local Agency project.

5.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Cipparrone Contracting, Inc.	\$731,468.20	Same	1 **
Dan's Excavating, Inc.	\$763,963.84	Same	2
C & D Hughes, Inc.	\$829,805.22	Same	3

Total Number of Bidders: 3

19. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 032
 Project: STL 81000-202692, ETC
 Local Agreement: 19-5335
 Start Date: 10 days after award
 Completion Date: July 31, 2020

Low Bid: **\$1,871,400.00**
 Engineer Estimate: \$1,620,507.30
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 15.48 %

6.72 mi of hot mix asphalt cold milling and resurfacing, concrete curb and gutter, sidewalk ramps and pavement markings on various routes, Washtenaw County. This is a Local Agency project.

3.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Cadillac Asphalt, L.L.C.	\$1,871,400.00	Same	1 **
Ajax Paving Industries, Inc.	\$2,521,205.83	Same	2

Total Number of Bidders: 2

20. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 033
 Project: ER 56000-203306
 Local Agreement: 19-5323
 Start Date: 10 days after award
 Completion Date: September 15, 2020

Low Bid: **\$916,364.01**
 Engineer Estimate: \$786,578.00
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 16.50 %

0.40 mi of hot mix asphalt removal and resurfacing, culvert replacement, storm sewer, guardrail, riprap and pavement markings on various routes at 13 locations, Midland County. This is a Local Agency project.

3.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
The Isabella Corporation	\$916,364.01	Same	1 **
Wonsey Tree Service, Inc.	\$923,584.79	Same	2
Malley Construction, Inc.	\$938,032.07	Same	3
Shaw Contracting Co.	\$987,955.40	Same	4
Crawford Contracting, Inc.	\$1,017,150.32	Same	5
Tri-City Groundbreakers, Inc.	\$1,144,184.00	Same	6

Total Number of Bidders: 6

21. Letting of July 12, 2019
 Letting Call: 1907 034
 Project: EDCF 41000-130613
 Local Agreement: 19-5286
 Start Date: 10 days after award
 Completion Date: June 15, 2020

Low Bid: **\$1,458,847.55**
 Engineer Estimate: \$1,255,438.56
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 16.20 %

0.50 mi of hot mix asphalt pavement widening, aggregate base, storm sewer, concrete pavement, curb, gutter, sidewalk and ramps, signals, water main, bridge rehabilitation with 36 inch prestressed concrete bulb-tee beams, steel sheet piling and pavement markings on 54th Street from Haughey Avenue to US-131 in the city of Wyoming, Kent County. This is a Local Agency project.

5.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Kamminga & Roodvoets, Inc.	\$1,458,847.55	Same	1 **
Anlaan Corporation	\$1,487,193.41	Same	2
Michigan Paving and Materials Company	\$1,965,970.89	Same	3

Total Number of Bidders: 3

On receipt of your approval, projects will, at the Director's discretion, be processed and awarded to the low bidder. I approve the project described in this agenda and authorize the award by the responsible management staff of MDOT to the extent authorized by and in accordance with the December 14, 1983, resolution of the State Transportation Commission and the Director's delegation memorandum of February 11, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

Signed copy on file

Paul C. Ajegba, P.E.
 Director

INFORMATION FOR MICHIGAN STATE
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

August 6, 2019

The following project information is being provided for informational purposes, as requested by the State Transportation Commission.

LOCAL PROJECTS

1. Letting of June 28, 2019
 Letting Call: 1906 902
 Project: HRRR 81000-203388
 Local Agreement: 19-5305
 Start Date: September 3, 2019
 Completion Date: October 31, 2019
 Low Bid: **\$432,066.70**
 Engineer Estimate: \$274,171.90
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 57.59 %

0.20 mi of hot mix asphalt crushing, shaping and resurfacing, concrete pavement, curb and gutter, aggregate base and pavement markings on Ridge Road at Hack Road, Washtenaw County. This is a Local Agency project.

3.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
Fonson Company, Inc.	\$432,066.70	Same	1 **

Total Number of Bidders: 1

2. Letting of June 28, 2019
 Letting Call: 1906 914
 Project: CMG 13000-121059
 Local Agreement: 19-5290
 Start Date: August 1, 2019
 Completion Date: February 1, 2020
 Low Bid: **\$424,471.63**
 Engineer Estimate: \$345,304.36
 Pct Over/Under Estimate: 22.93 %

0.04 mi of concrete curb, gutter and sidewalk ramps and signal upgrades on Capital Avenue at Michigan Avenue in the city of Battle Creek, Calhoun County. This is a Local Agency project.

0.00 % DBE participation required

Bidder	As-Submitted	As-Checked	
J. Ranck Electric, Inc.	\$424,471.63	Same	1 **

Total Number of Bidders: 1

EXHIBIT A-3
August 6, 2019

These projects, for which the bid is under Five Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$500,000) and has less than two (2) bidders or is a low bid rejection or have other bid issues, are being submitted for informational purposes. The contracts for these projects will, at the Director's discretion, be processed and awarded to the low bidder. I approve the projects described in this agenda and authorize the award by the responsible management staff of MDOT to the extent authorized by and in accordance with the December 14, 1983, resolution of the State Transportation Commission and the Director's delegation memorandum February 11, 2019.

Respectfully submitted,

Signed copy on file

Paul C. Ajegba, P.E.
Director